

CRD SEWAGE TREATMENT PLANS

CADBORO BAY RESIDENTS ASSOCIATION CONCERNS – November 2007

A. Our understanding of the current situation – based on reports available through the CRD web site and material from the Core Area Waste Management Committee Meeting of October 10th 2007.

- 1. CRD has submitted an overall regional plan to the Province recommending a “de-centralised” sewage treatment system that includes a Saanich East Treatment Plant.**
- 2. A local treatment plant would incorporate connection to an extended Finnerty Cove outfall.**
- 3. A treatment plant site of up to one hectare is proposed, plus a 30 metre buffer zone, requiring a total area of about 2.5 hectares (6 acres.)**
- 4. The draft implementation plan shows \$70 million to be spent on immediate design and construction of the Saanich East Plant and the improved and extended Finnerty Cove outfall over the next four years (2008 to 2011).**
- 5. A site selection study is now underway that includes social and environmental evaluations of alternative treatment plant locations.**
- 6. Plant locations to be evaluated include the Queen Alexandra property, Haro Woods, and the University area (in Saanich or in North Oak Bay).**

B. Concerns regarding the current situation and the proposed Saanich East Treatment Plant.

- 1. A sewage treatment plant would have major impacts on the Cadboro Bay community in any location within this area.**
- 2. Such a plant could not be accommodated on the lower portion of the Queen Alexandra site close to the Finnerty Cove outfall without removal of all existing buildings in that location. The upper area close to Arbutus Road would have to be used if the Queen Alexandra location were chosen.**
- 3. Such a plant site (6 acres) would consume about 60% of the Saanich owned Haro Woods area if that location were chosen.**
- 4. Sites to be evaluated within the University are not known by us at this time.**
- 5. All potential sewage treatment plant sites are at present accessible park-like areas adjacent to residential areas.**
- 6. These areas are used extensively by local residents and are vital to the livability of our unique community.**

C. Concerns regarding the process to date.

- 1. The inclusion of a Saanich East Plant in the proposed regional sewage system, as submitted to the Province in June 2007, came from the results of “triple bottom line” assessment procedures designed to give equal weight to three components in evaluating region wide options:**
 - **Engineering and Costs**
 - **Social Impacts**
 - **Environmental Impacts**

- 2. We believe that social and environmental considerations may have been dealt with at an inadequate level and that no real case has been made for the necessity to include a Saanich East Plant in the future system.**

- 3. A half-million dollar study has now been launched to review social and environmental aspects of local site alternatives. However, none of this new expertise and information gathering was used prior to June 2007 in the assessments that led to the decision to include Saanich East in the recommended regional system.**

- 4. In the published Triple Bottom Line Evaluation Tables that resulted in the June 2007 recommended system, ratings were allocated for the various economic, social and environmental criteria in assessing options for the whole regional treatment system.**

- 5. Specific criteria in the tables, where the effect of adding in the extra Saanich East Plant was rated highest and best in overall regional terms, included the items below. The Residents Association questions the validity of these findings made prior to June 2007.**
 - **Maximum economic development opportunities**
 - **Minimum community disruption**
 - **Maximum opportunities for on-site mitigation**
 - **Maximum recreation and education opportunities**
 - **Minimum disruption to natural areas**
 - **Maximum opportunities for re-use of treated effluent**

- 6. No significant regional cost advantages were identified for inclusion of a Saanich East Plant in the June 2007 plan. If re-examination of the items listed above can take place when the detailed social and environmental assessments have been completed, this may well show the inclusion of a Saanich East Plant to be a much less viable “triple bottom line” option.**

- 7. Ground water infiltration has been identified as a major problem on the existing Saanich East and Oak Bay sections of the trunk sewer system. Is an action plan being developed to deal with this infiltration problem and thus further reduce the need for a Saanich East Treatment Plant?**

D. Concerns regarding Potential Site Selection Criteria (Westland Memorandum of October 4th 2007)

- 1. A workshop should be held with residents associations of Cadboro Bay and Gordon Head (plus North Oak Bay) to examine proposed site criteria and ratings and review a short list of alternative Saanich East treatment plant locations.**

- 2. An extensive listing of criteria is provided in the memorandum. Preliminary comments include:**
 - We support high weight for ecological features**
 - Consistency with community plans should be a high weight item**
 - Re-use of wastewater is commendable but is it economically feasible?**
 - Existing local community use factors should be weighted higher**
 - Potential treatment site recreational and educational uses are omitted (good)**
 - The allocations of distances from the treatment site boundaries need to be carefully reviewed (residential areas, heritage structures etc.)**
 - Transportation should be given higher weight.**
 - The outfall location factor is meaningless in comparing alternatives – the maximum distance only covers the impractical lower Queen Alexandra area.**

REQUESTED ACTIONS

- CONVENE A RESIDENT'S WORKSHOP FOR THE SAANICH EAST SITE SELECTION PROCESS**

- REASSESS THE NEED FOR A SAANICH EAST TREATMENT PLANT BASED ON THE RESULTS OF THE NEW SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL STUDY**

- THE GROUNDWATER INFILTRATION PROBLEM SHOULD BE ADDRESSED**

- THE ECONOMIC COSTS AND THE SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF IMPLEMENTING A SAANICH EAST PLANT SHOULD BE DIRECTLY COMPARED TO ANY BENEFITS IDENTIFIED FOR THE CLOVER POINT AND MACAULAY PLANTS**

**Prepared by David Langley
Member of Sewage Treatment
Sub Committee Nov 25 2007**

**Reviewed by Irene Stewart
Association President
Nov 26 2007**

